1 2 3 4 5 6 7 8	KEKER, VAN NEST & PETERS LLP BAILEY W. HEAPS - # 295870 bheaps@keker.com JASON GEORGE - # 307707 jgeorge@keker.com JACQUELINE CONCILLA - # 335733 jconcilla@keker.com 633 Battery Street San Francisco, CA 94111-1809 Telephone: 415 391 5400 Facsimile: 415 397 7188 Attorneys for Petitioner NEWPORT BEACH STE ASSOCIATION	EWARDSHIP
9 10 11	SUPERIOR COURT OF THE	
12 13 14	NEWPORT BEACH STEWARDSHIP ASSOCIATION, Petitioner and Plaintiff,	Case No. 30-2024-01428295-CU-WM-CXC REQUEST FOR JUDICIAL NOTICE IN SUPPORT OF MOTION FOR JUDGMENT
15 16 17	v. CITY OF NEWPORT BEACH, Respondent and Defendant.	Date: April 24, 2025 Time: 2:00 p.m. Dept.: CX104 Judge: Hon. Melissa R. McCormick Date Filed: September 24, 2024
18 19 20		Reservation Number: 74440753
21 22		
2324		
2526		
2728		

TABLE OF CONTENTS 1 I. 2 II. 3 A. 4 The Court should take judicial notice of materials from City Council В. 5 meeting and Planning Commission meeting agenda packets......14 6 Approved minutes and videos of City Council and Planning Commission C. meetings. D. Recent ballot measures related to Housing Elements are properly the 8 subject of judicial notice. 9 The Court should take judicial notice of a Superior Court order in Building E. Industry Association of San Diego County v. City of Encinitas.19 10 III. 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18 19 20 21 22 23 24 25 26 27 28

TABLE OF AUTHORITIES

2	Page(s)
3	State Cases
45	Agostini v. Strycula (1965) 231 Cal.App.2d 804
6	American Contractors Indemnity Co. v. County of Orange (2005) 103 Cal.App.4th 579
8	Building Industry Association of San Diego County v. City of Encinitas, Case No. 37-2017-00023267-CU-WM-NC
9	Coalition Advocating Legal Housing Options v. City of Santa Monica (2001) 88 Cal.App.4th 451
11	Coastal Protection Alliance Inc. v. Airbnb, Inc. (2023) 95 Cal.App.5th 207
13	Dailey v. City of San Diego (2013) 223 Cal.App.4th 237
14 15	Evans v. City of Berkeley (2006) 38 Cal.4th 1
16 17	Glaski v. Bank of America (2013) 218 Cal.App.4th 1079
18	LaGrone v. City of Oakland (2011) 202 Cal.App.4th 932
19 20	Moehring v. Thomas (2005) 126 Cal.App.4th 1515
21	People v. Krohn (2007) 149 Cal.App.4th 1294
22 23	Shaw v. People ex rel. Chiang (2009) 175 Cal.App.4th 577
24 25	Social Services Union v. City and County of San Francisco (1991) 234 Cal.App.3d 1093
26	Tower Lane Properties v. City of Los Angeles (2014) 224 Cal.App.4th 262
27 28	Trancas Property Owners Assn. v. City of Malibu (2006) 138 Cal.App.4th 172
	3

1	Trinity Park, L.P. v. City of Sunnyvale (2011) 193 Cal.App.4th 1014
2 3	United Neighborhoods for Los Angeles v. City of Los Angeles
4	(2023) 93 Cal.App.5th 1074
5	(2009) 46 Cal.4th 1
6	Yumori-Kaku v. City of Santa Clara (2020) 59 Cal.App.5th 385
7	State Statutes
8	
9	Cal. Evid. Code § 200
10	Cal. Evid. Code § 452
11	
12	
13	
14	
15	
16	
17	
18	
19	
20	
21	
22	
23	
24	
25	
26	
27	
28	
	4

REQUEST FOR JUDICIAL NOTICE

In support of Petitioner and Plaintiff Newport Beach Stewardship Association's
("NBSA's") Motion for Judgment, and pursuant to Evidence Code sections 452 and 453, NBSA
requests that this Court take judicial notice of documents providing the factual basis for its
Petition for Writ of Mandate and Complaint for Declaratory Relief and its concurrently filed
Motion for Judgment. Specifically, NBSA seeks judicial notice of ordinances and City Council
deliberations leading up to and following the City of Newport Beach's (the "City's") violation of
Section 423 of the City's Charter, which are attached to the concurrently filed Movant's Index of
Exhibits:

Legislative Enactments

- Exhibit 71: Section 423 of the City of Newport Beach City Charter, available at https://www.codepublishing.com/CA/NewportBeach/#!/NewportBeachCH.html#04.423.
- Exhibit 15: City Council Resolution No. 2022-60, which amended and adopted the Sixth Cycle Housing Element on September 13, 2022, available at https://ecms.newportbeachca.gov/WEB/DocView.aspx?id=2833875&dbid=0&repo=CNB.
- Exhibit 60: Amended City of Newport Beach Housing Element, adopted pursuant to City Council Resolution No. 2024-58 and 2024-73 on July 23, 2024 and September 24, 2024, respectively, available at https://www.newportbeachca.gov/government/departments/community-development/planning-division/general-plan-codes-and-regulations/general-plan-update/housing-element-screencheck-draft-march-10-2020.
- Exhibit 48: Amended City of Newport Beach Land Use Element, adopted pursuant to City Council Resolution No. 2024-51 on July 23, 2024, available at https://www.newportbeachca.gov/PLN/General Plan/04 Ch3 LandUse web.pdf.
- Exhibit 23: City Council Resolution No. 2024-32, providing notice of necessary zoning changes to the Orange County Airport Land Use Commission for the Housing Element implementation on May 28, 2024, available at https://ecms.newportbeachca.gov/WEB/DocView.aspx?id=3004538&dbid=0&repo=CNB.
- Exhibit 42: City Council Resolution No. 2024-50, certifying the Environmental Impact Report related to the Housing Element implementation on July 23, 2024, available at https://ecms.newportbeachca.gov/WEB/DocView.aspx?id=3038657&dbid=0&repo=CNB.
- Exhibit 49: City Council Resolution No. 2024-51, amending the City of Newport Beach's Land Use Element on July 23, 2024, available at https://ecms.newportbeachca.gov/WEB/DocView.aspx?id=3038659&dbid=0&repo=CNB.
- Exhibit 50: City Council Resolution No. 2024-52, providing notice to California Coastal Commission of zoning changes related to Housing Element adoption on July 23, 2024, available at https://ecms.newportbeachca.gov/WEB/DocView.aspx?id=3038660&dbid=0&repo=CNB.

- Exhibit 38: City Council Resolution No. 2024-58, initiating the process to amend the Housing Element on July 23, 2024, available at https://ecms.newportbeachca.gov/WEB/DocView.aspx?id=3038662&dbid=0&repo=CNB.
- Exhibit 70: City Council Resolution No. 2024-73, adopting the amended Housing Element that eliminates a Section 423 vote, on September 24, 2024, available at https://ecms.newportbeachca.gov/WEB/DocView.aspx?id=3061225&dbid=0&repo=CNB.
- Exhibit 51: City Ordinance No. 2024-16, modifying the city's municipal code regarding zoning on September 24, 2024, available at https://ecms.newportbeachca.gov/WEB/DocView.aspx?id=3061231&dbid=0&repo=CNB.
- Exhibit 52: City Ordinance No. 2024-17, amending title 20 (planning and zoning) and adopting objective development standards, available at https://ecms.newportbeachca.gov/WEB/DocView.aspx?id=3061230&dbid=0&repo=CNB.
- Exhibit 59: Planning Commission Resolution No. PC2024-019, on September 5, 2024, available at https://ecms.newportbeachca.gov/WEB/DocView.aspx?id=3062791&dbid=0&repo=CNB.
- Exhibit 21: Planning Commission Resolution No. PC2024-006, on April 14, 2024, available at https://ecms.newportbeachca.gov/WEB/DocView.aspx?id=3012085&dbid=0&repo=CNB.

Agenda Packet for September 13, 2022 City Council Meeting

- Exhibit 1: Correspondence to the City Council providing comments on the proposed housing element in advance of the September 13, 2022 City Council meeting, available at https://ecms.newportbeachca.gov/WEB/DocView.aspx?id=2833863&dbid=0&repo=CNB.
- Exhibit 2: City Council Staff Report titled "Ordinance No. 2022-18: A Code Amendment Updating Density Bonus Regulations to Comply with State Law (PA2020-032)" that was prepared by the City's Principal Planner, Jaime Murillo, in connection with the September 13, 2022 City Council meeting, available at https://ecms.newportbeachca.gov/WEB/DocView.aspx?id=2833796&dbid=0&repo=CNB.
- Exhibit 3: Overview of the City Council meeting agenda from September 13, 2022 titled "On the Agenda: City Council Meeting for Sept. 13," available at https://ecms.newportbeachca.gov/WEB/DocView.aspx?id=2833860&dbid=0&repo=CNB.
- Exhibit 4: Presentation titled "2021-2029 6th Cycle Final Housing Element," dated September 13, 2022, and prepared by the City's Community Development Department, available at https://ecms.newportbeachca.gov/WEB/DocView.aspx?id=2833865&dbid=0&repo=CNB.
- Exhibit 5: Handout titled "Item 18 Resolution No. 2022-60: Amending and Re-Adopting the 2021-2029 6th Cycle Housing Element," dated September 13, 2022, available at https://ecms.newportbeachca.gov/WEB/DocView.aspx?id=2833869&dbid=0&repo=CNB.
- Exhibit 6: "September 13, 2022, City Council Agenda Comments" submitted by Jim Mosher of Newport Beach, available at https://ecms.newportbeachca.gov/WEB/DocView.aspx?id=2833861&dbid=0&repo=CNB.

- **Exhibit 7**: City Council Agenda for the September 13, 2022 City Council meeting, available at https://ecms.newportbeachca.gov/WEB/DocView.aspx?id=2833840&dbid=0&repo=CNB.
- Exhibit 8: Amended City Council Meeting Minutes from the August 23, 2022 City Council Meeting, available at https://ecms.newportbeachca.gov/WEB/DocView.aspx?id=2833862&dbid=0&repo=CNB.
- Exhibit 9: Draft City Council Meeting Minutes from the Study Session and Regular Meeting on August 23, 2022, available at https://ecms.newportbeachca.gov/WEB/DocView.aspx?id=2833802&dbid=0&repo=CNB.
- Exhibit 10: City Council Staff Report titled "Resolution No. 2022-59: Creating the General Plan Advisory Committee (GPAC)" prepared by the City's Principal Planner, Benjamin M. Zdeba, and dated September 13, 2022, available at https://ecms.newportbeachca.gov/WEB/DocView.aspx?id=2833810&dbid=0&repo=CNB.
- Exhibit 11: City Council Staff Report titled "Resolution No. 2022-60: Amending and Re-Adopting the 2021-2029 6th Cycle Housing Element" that was prepared by the City's Senior Planner, Benjamin M. Zdeba, and Deputy Community Development Director, Jim Campbell, in connection with the September 13, 2022 City Council meeting, available at https://ecms.newportbeachca.gov/WEB/DocView.aspx?id=2833796&dbid=0&repo=CNB.
- Exhibit 13: Notice of Public Hearing from the City regarding the September 13, 2022 City Council meeting, available at https://ecms.newportbeachca.gov/WEB/DocView.aspx?id=2834173&dbid=0&repo=CNB.

Agenda Packet for April 18, 2024 Planning Commission Meeting

- Exhibit 16: Letter from Melinda Coy, Proactive Housing Accountability Chief of the California Department of Housing and Community Development, to Grace K. Leung, City Manager of the City of Newport Beach, regarding "City of Newport Beach 6th Cycle (2021-2029) Adopted Housing Element, dated October 5, 2022, available at https://www.newportbeachca.gov/home/showpublisheddocument/72517/63800639758447 0000.
- Exhibit 17: City Planning Commission Staff Report regarding "Housing Element Implementation Program Amendments (PA2022-0245) that was prepared by the City's principal planner, Benjamin M. Zdeba, and Acting Deputy Community Development Director, Jaime Murillo, dated April 18, 2024, available at https://ecms.newportbeachca.gov/WEB/DocView.aspx?id=2954635&dbid=0&repo=CNB.
- Exhibit 18: City Planning Commission Agenda from the April 18, 2024 Planning Commission meeting, available at https://ecms.newportbeachca.gov/WEB/DocView.aspx?id=2954621&dbid=0&repo=CNB.

Agenda Packet for July 9, 2024 City Council Meeting

- Exhibit 24: City Council Agenda from the July 9, 2024 City Council meeting, available at https://ecms.newportbeachca.gov/WEB/DocView.aspx?id=3031028&dbid=0&repo=CNB.
- Exhibit 25: City Council Meeting Minutes from the Study Session and Regular Meeting on July 9, 2024, available at https://ecms.newportbeachca.gov/WEB/DocView.aspx?id=3038655&dbid=0&repo=CNB.

- Exhibit 26: City Council Agenda Comments on items on the agenda for the July 9, 2024 City Council Meeting, available at https://ecms.newportbeachca.gov/WEB/DocView.aspx?id=3031077&dbid=0&repo=CNB.
- Exhibit 27: Correspondence to the City Council regarding the July 9, 2024 City Council meeting, available at https://ecms.newportbeachca.gov/WEB/DocView.aspx?id=3031076&dbid=0&repo=CNB.
- Exhibit 28: Presentation titled "Implementation of the Housing Element and Charter Section 423" prepared by the Community Development Department for the City Council Study Session on July 9, 2024, available at https://ecms.newportbeachca.gov/WEB/DocView.aspx?id=3031110&dbid=0&repo=CNB.

Agenda Packet for July 23, 2024 City Council Meeting

- Exhibit 22: Handout titled "California Housing Legislative Highlights," which is part of the July 23, 2024 City Council meeting agenda packet, available at https://ecms.newportbeachca.gov/WEB/DocView.aspx?id=3038623&dbid=0&repo=CNB &cr=1.
- Exhibit 30: Letter from Jennifer L. Keller to Mayor Will O'Neill and the Newport Beach City Council regarding "Voter approval of Newport Beach's Certified Sixth Cycle Housing Element under Charter Section 423," dated July 22, 2024, available at https://ecms.newportbeachca.gov/WEB/DocView.aspx?id=3038580&dbid=0&repo=CNB &cr=1
- Exhibit 31: Weekly Newsletter from City Manager Grace K. Leung titled "The Week in Review," available at https://ecms.newportbeachca.gov/WEB/DocView.aspx?id=3038581&dbid=0&repo=CNB.
- Exhibit 32: Presentation titled a "A Brief Timeline" regarding the Housing Element, available at https://ecms.newportbeachca.gov/WEB/DocView.aspx?id=3038624&dbid=0&repo=CNB.
- Exhibit 33: Letter from Marshal "Duffy" Duffield, former City Council member and Mayor, and Joy Brenner, former City Council member, to Mayor Will O'Neil and members of the City Council, dated July 23, 2024, available at https://ecms.newportbeachca.gov/WEB/DocView.aspx?id=3038652&dbid=0&repo=CNB.
- Exhibit 34: City Council Agenda from the July 23, 2024 City Council meeting, available at https://ecms.newportbeachca.gov/WEB/DocView.aspx?id=3038502&dbid=0&repo=CNB.
- Exhibit 35: Amended City Council Meeting Minutes from the Study Session and Regular Meeting on July 9, 2024, available at https://ecms.newportbeachca.gov/WEB/DocView.aspx?id=3038571&dbid=0&repo=CNB.
- Exhibit 37: City Council Resolution No. 2024-53, available at https://ecms.newportbeachca.gov/WEB/DocView.aspx?id=3038661&dbid=0&repo=CNB.
- Exhibit 39: City Council Staff Report regarding "Ordinance Nos. 2024-16 and 2024-17, and Resolution Nos. 2024-50 to 2024-57 for the Necessary Amendments to Implement the 6th Housing Cycle Housing Element and to Place the Major General Plan Amendment on the November 5, 2024 General Election Ballot Pursuant to City Charter Section 423; or

https://ecms.newportbeachca.gov/WEB/DocView.aspx?id=3049492&dbid=0&repo=CNB.

Meeting on July 23, 2024, available at

27

MEMORANDUM OF POINTS AND AUTHORITIES

I. INTRODUCTION

1

2

3

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

Petitioner Newport Beach Stewardship Association ("NBSA") requests that the Court take judicial notice of Exhibits 1-75 to Movant's Index of Exhibits ("MI"), which is filed concurrently herewith, pursuant to California Code of Evidence § 452, subdivisions (b) and (h). Those documents fall into the following categories:

- (1) Legislative enactments relevant to this dispute, including the relevant versions of the City's Housing Element, Land Use Element, as well as various related resolutions and ordinances passed by the City's City Council and Planning Commission;
- (2) Agenda packets containing documents considered by the City Council and Planning Commission in passing the relevant legislative enactments;
- (3) Approved minutes and videos of the relevant City Council and Planning Commission meetings;
- (4) Recent ballot measures in the cities of Yorba Linda and Cypress from the November 2024 general election regarding implementation of those cities' housing elements; and
- (5) California Superior Court order in Building Industry Association of San Diego County
- v. City of Encinitas, Case No. 37-2017-00023267-CU-WM-NC.

Each of these categories of documents is subject to judicial notice. Evidence Code 452, subdivision (b) explicitly provides for judicial notice of legislative enactments of public entities like the City, which includes the City Charter, the City's Housing Element, and various related resolutions and ordinances. Most of the documents subject to this Request for Judicial Notice, including the legislative history agenda packets, were sourced from the City's official online repository for public records, and so the existence and contents of these documents are not reasonably subject to dispute and are capable of immediate and accurate determination by resort

²⁵

²⁸

⁽Public Records, City of Newport Beach, https://www.newportbeachca.gov/government/datahub/public-records [providing functionality to "[s]earch public records" with links to online repository]; Agendas & Minutes, City of Newport Beach,

https://www.newportbeachca.gov/government/data-hub/agendas-minutes ["Access complete City Council meeting documents, resolutions and ordinances using the City's specialized application, Laserfiche."]; Laserfiche, City of Newport Beach,

https://www.newportbeachca.gov/government/data-hub/public-records/laserfiche.)

to sources of reasonably indisputable accuracy." (Evid. Code § 452, subd. (h).) The court should thus take judicial notice of the existence, content, and authenticity of these documents. (*Glaski v. Bank of America* (2013) 218 Cal.App.4th 1079, 1090 ["Courts can take judicial notice of the existence, content and authenticity of public records and other specified documents, but do not take judicial notice of the truth of the factual matters asserted in those documents."].)

II. ARGUMENT

NBSA seeks judicial notice of (1) legislative enactments; (2) agenda packets related to those legislative enactments; (3) approved minutes and videos of relevant City Council and Planning Commission meetings; (4) ballot measures from the cities of Yorba Linda and Cypress; and (5) a California Superior Court order. All of these documents are properly the subject of judicial notice.

A. The Court should take judicial notice of legislative enactments.

MI Exs. 15, 21, 23, 38, 48, 42, 49, 50, 51, 52, 59, 60, 70, 71 are legislative enactments that are subject to judicial notice under Evidence Code § 452, subdivision (b). Courts may take judicial notice of regulations and legislative enactments issued by or under the authority of any public entity in the United States. (Evid. Code § 452, subd. (b).) "Public entit[ies]" include political subdivisions such as cities and counties. (Evid. Code § 200.) The existence and contents of legislative enactments are also "not reasonably subject to dispute and are capable of immediate and accurate determination by resort to sources of reasonably indisputable accuracy." (Evid. Code § 452, subd. (h).) Courts have thus taken judicial notice of city and county ordinances, codes, and similar legislative enactments. (See e.g., Tower Lane Properties v. City of Los Angeles (2014) 224 Cal.App.4th 262, 272 fn.6 ["We may take judicial notice of local ordinances and other official resolutions, reports, and acts of a city."].) This includes a city charter (LaGrone v. City of Oakland (2011) 202 Cal. App. 4th 932, 941 fn.3), as well as "official resolutions, reports, and other official acts of a city." (Trinity Park, L.P. v. City of Sunnyvale (2011) 193 Cal.App.4th 1014, 1027; see also Dailey v. City of San Diego (2013) 223 Cal. App. 4th 237, 244 fn. 1 [taking judicial notice of city council resolutions and city ordinances]; Evans v. City of Berkeley (2006) 38 Cal.4th 1, 7 fn.2 [judicial notice of city council resolution].) The various elements of a general

26

27

plan, such as the Housing Element, are also the proper subject of judicial notice. (*Coalition Advocating Legal Housing Options v. City of Santa Monica* (2001) 88 Cal.App.4th 451, 462 fn.7; *United Neighborhoods for Los Angeles v. City of Los Angeles* (2023) 93 Cal.App.5th 1074, 1082 fn.4.)

Here, NBSA seeks judicial notice of MI Exs. 15, 21, 23, 38, 48, 42, 49, 50, 51, 52, 59, 60, 70, 71 each of which is a legislative enactment relevant to the dispute between parties.

Specifically, Section 423 of the City Charter (MI Ex. 71) can be judicially noticed and is relevant because it is the basis for NBSA's Petition. NBSA's Petition for Writ of Mandate seeks a writ overturning City Council Resolution Nos. 2024-51 (MI Ex. 49), 2024-58 (MI Ex. 38), and 2024-73 (MI Ex. 70). And City Council Resolution Nos. 2022-60 (MI Ex. 15), 2024-32 (MI Ex. 23), 2024-50 (MI Ex. 42), and 2024-52 (MI Ex. 50) provide context surrounding the adoption of the Housing Element in 2022 and later steps in its implementation. The Housing Element as it was originally adopted in September 2022 (MI Ex. 15, Exhibit A) and as it was amended earlier this year (MI Ex. 60), and the amended Land Use Element adopted without Section 423 voter approval (MI Ex. 48) are central documents to this dispute. These legislative enactments are each properly subject to judicial notice. (See, e.g., *Coalition Advocating Legal Housing Options v. City of Santa Monica*, *supra*, 88 Cal.App.4th at 462 fn.7)

B. The Court should take judicial notice of materials from City Council meeting and Planning Commission meeting agenda packets.

The resolutions, ordinances, and Housing Elements noted above were the product of numerous City Council and Planning Commission meetings. NBSA seeks judicial notice of the documents considered at those meetings, namely, relevant portions of "Agenda Packets" for each meeting relevant to the above legislative enactments. The meetings at issue are the following:

- September 13, 2022 City Council Meeting: The City Council adopted the Housing
 Element containing a plan to obtain voter approval pursuant to Section 423 of the City
 Charter through Resolution No. 2022-60.
- April 18, 2024 Planning Commission Meeting: The Planning Commission considered staff reports and issued recommendations to the City Council regarding amendments to

the plan to implement the Housing Element to remove the Section 423 vote.

- July 9, 2024 City Council Meeting: The City Council considered in a study session the issues related to amending the Land Use Element and Housing Element without a Section 423 vote.
- July 23, 2024 City Council Meeting: After considering City staff reports and
 presentations, the City Council passed resolutions that initiated the process to amend the
 Housing Element to remove the Section 423 vote (Resolution No. 2024-58) and to modify
 the Land Use Element to implement the Housing Element without a Section 423 vote
 (Resolution No. 2024-51).
- September 5, 2024: The Planning Commission made recommendations to the City
 Council to implement the Housing Element through amendments to the general plan
 without a Section 423 vote.
- September 24, 2024: The City Council adopted the amended Housing Element
 (Resolution No. 2024-73) that removed the Section 423 right to vote and passed
 ordinances modifying the municipal code to implement the Housing Element (Ordinance
 Nos. 2024-16, 2024-17).

These documents are relevant because they provide the background, bases, and rationale for the City's decision to eliminate the Section 423 vote on the Land Use Element amendments that implement the City's Housing Element. The existence, content, and authenticity of these documents are subject to judicial notice for two reasons.

First, the agenda packets are relevant legislative history of the legislative enactments concerning the City's elimination of the Section 423 vote. These agenda packets include staff reports and presentations prepared to inform the City Council and Planning Commission regarding issues related to the proposed legislation (see, e.g., MI Ex. 2), ordinances and other legislative enactments (see, e.g., MI Ex. 21), letters from citizens concerning the proposed legislative acts (see, e.g., MI Ex. 6), letters from state regulators (MI Ex. 16), agendas for the meetings (MI Ex. 7, 18, 24, 34, 55, 62), and other documents that the City Council and Planning Commission considered in conjunction with the relevant legislative enactments discussed above.

Legislative history concerning these provisions is the proper subject of judicial notice. (*Evans v. City of Berkeley, supra*, 38 Cal.4th at 7, 9 fns. 2, 5 [holding that "city manager's memorandum to the mayor and city council recommending the resolution's adoption" was properly subject to judicial notice as legislative history]; *People v. Krohn* (2007) 149 Cal.App.4th 1294, 1298 fn.3 [judicial notice of legislative history of City ordinance].)

Second, the existence, contents, and authenticity of the agenda packets "are not reasonably subject to dispute and are capable of immediate and accurate determination by resort to sources of reasonably indisputable accuracy." (Evid. Code § 452, subd. (h).) It is proper to take judicial notice of the "existence, content and authenticity of public records" (Glaski v. Bank of America, supra, 218 Cal.App.4th at 1090), including "records and proceedings" before a public governmental entity (Agostini v. Strycula (1965) 231 Cal.App.2d 804, 806; see also, e.g., Trancas Property Owners Assn. v. City of Malibu (2006) 138 Cal. App. 4th 172, 178 fn.3 ["The city has requested that we take judicial notice of this [city council] agenda. We do so, but only as proof of its contents."]). Moreover, as stated in the concurrently filed Declaration of Bailey W. Heaps, each of the agenda packet documents was downloaded from https://ecms.newportbeachca.gov, which is the City's online repository of public records.² Reliance on that online repository is appropriate for purposes of judicial notice. (Moehring v. Thomas (2005) 126 Cal. App. 4th 1515, 1524 fn.5 ["Plaintiffs ask us to take judicial notice of other information found on the [U.S. Forest Service] Web site. The parties' requests for judicial notice are granted"]; Shaw v. People ex rel. Chiang (2009) 175 Cal. App. 4th 577, 606 fn. 10 [judicial notice of "official acts and public records" on government website appropriate].) Although the parties may dispute certain factual assertions in these agenda packets, their existence, contents, and authenticity, and the fact that they were considered by the City Council and Planning Commission at the relevant meetings, are not subject to dispute, and thus the documents are the proper subject of judicial notice.

27

28

24

https://www.newportbeachca.gov/government/data-hub/public-records/laserfiche.)

²⁵²⁶

² (Public Records, City of Newport Beach, https://www.newportbeachca.gov/government/data-hub/public-records [providing functionality to "[s]earch public records" with links to online repository]; Agendas & Minutes, City of Newport Beach,

https://www.newportbeachca.gov/government/data-hub/agendas-minutes ["Access complete City Council meeting documents, resolutions and ordinances using the City's specialized application, Laserfiche."]; Laserfiche, City of Newport Beach,

C. Approved minutes and videos of City Council and Planning Commission meetings.

In addition to the materials from agenda packets for relevant City Council and Planning Commission meetings discussed above, NBSA seeks judicial notice of the official minutes and video recordings of the above meetings where the City Council or the Planning Commission discussed the relevant legislative enactments. Specifically, this section concerns the minutes and video recordings of the City Council meetings on September 13, 2022 (MI Exs. 8, 12, 14), July 9, 2024 (MI Exs. 25, 29), July 23, 2024 (MI Exs. 35, 36, 47), and September 24, 2024 (MI Exs. 63, 69) and the Planning Commission meetings on April 18, 2024 (MI Exs. 19, 20) and September 5, 2024 (MI Exs. 56, 58). As with the materials from agenda packets, the meeting minutes and video recordings are subject to judicial notice because they constitute the legislative history of the legislative enactments discussed above. (See, e.g., People v. Krohn, supra, 149 Cal.App.4th at 1298 fn.3 [allowing judicial notice of legislative history of ordinance].) Further, the existence, contents, and authenticity of the meeting minutes and videos of the meetings "are not reasonably subject to dispute and are capable of immediate and accurate determination by resort to sources of reasonably indisputable accuracy." (Evid. Code § 452, subd. (h).) The Court of Appeal has held that "official minutes" of local government meetings are "clearly a matter of which [a court] can take judicial notice." (Social Services Union v. City and County of San Francisco (1991) 234 Cal.App.3d 1093, 1098 fn.3.) The same is true of videos of such meetings. (Coastal Protection Alliance Inc. v. Airbnb, Inc. (2023) 95 Cal. App. 5th 207, 220 fn.8 [taking judicial notice of "videorecordings" of Coastal Commission meetings under Evidence Code § 452, subdivisions (c) and (h)]; cf. Agostini v. Strycula, supra, 231 Cal.App.2d at 806 [local government "records and proceedings" subject to judicial notice].) Each of the meeting minutes and videos was downloaded from the City's online public record repository, discussed above, which is available at https://ecms.newportbeachca.gov.³ The videos' existence, content, and authenticity is thus not

28

1

2

3

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

2.1

22

23

24

²⁶²⁷

³ (Agendas & Minutes, City of Newport Beach, https://www.newportbeachca.gov/government/data-hub/agendas-minutes.) Note that the videos are hosted on the website https://newportbeach.granicus.com, but the City makes the links to that website available through the same https://ecms.newportbeachca.gov repository.

subject to reasonable dispute. The Court should thus take judicial notice of these videos.

D. Recent ballot measures related to Housing Elements are properly the subject of judicial notice.

NBSA seeks judicial notice of ballot measures from the cities of Yorba Linda and Cypress that were voted on in the recent November 5, 2024 general election, and the fact that voters approved them (as shown in the Orange County Registrar of Voters' "Unofficial Election Results" for the November 5, 2024 general election, MI Ex. 74). Measure JJ asked residents of Yorba Linda to vote on a change to the city's land use laws as part of the "implementation programs of the city of Yorba Linda 2021-2029 Housing Element" and as required by the "Yorba Linda Right-to-Vote Amendment." MI Ex. 72 at 2. Measure S asked residents of Cypress to vote on one proposed way of implementing its "2021-2029 Housing Element." MI Ex. 73 at 2. NBSA relies on these measures to show that numerous jurisdictions have put the implementation of their Housing Element to a vote of residents, and that such votes were not "precluded" by state law.

Because the ballot measures were approved by voters, they are "legislative enactments" that are subject to judicial notice. (Evid. Code § 452, subd. (b).) The Exhibits at issue here, which are the official ballot pamphlets, are further subject to judicial notice because such ballot pamphlets are "official government document[s]" pursuant to Evidence Code 452, subdivision (c). (*Vargas v. City of Salinas* (2009) 46 Cal.4th 1, 22 fn.10 [taking judicial notice of pamphlet for local ballot measure].) Moreover, the existence and content of these ballot measures, and the election results, are "[f]acts and propositions that are not reasonably subject to dispute and are capable of immediate and accurate determination by resort to sources of reasonably indisputable accuracy." (Evid. Code, § 452, subd. (h).) The Court of Appeal has held that "ballot measure[s]" and "election results" can be judicially noticed. (*Yumori-Kaku v. City of Santa Clara* (2020) 59 Cal.App.5th 385, 430 fn.12 [taking judicial notice of a "ballot measure, [and] the election results on the ballot measure produced by the county registrar."].) Finally, these documents are public records available on the Orange County Registrar of Voters' website at http://www.ocvote.gov and thus their existence, authenticity, and content are appropriately subject to judicial notice. (See *Shaw v. People ex rel. Chiang, supra*, 175 Cal.App.4th at 606 n.10 [judicial notice of "official").

1	acts and public records" on government website appropriate].)			
2 3	E. The Court should take judicial notice of a Superior Court order in Building Industry Association of San Diego County v. City of Encinitas.			
	NBSA also seeks judicial notice of the Superior Court of San Diego County's order in			
4	Building Industry Association of San Diego County v. City of Encinitas, dated December 12, 2018			
5	(MI Ex. 75). The Court should take judicial notice of Exhibit 75 pursuant to Evidence Code			
6	Section 452(d), which provides that judicial notice may be taken of "[r]ecords of [] any court of			
7	this state." This includes orders in other actions. (See, e.g., American Contractors Indemnity Co.			
8	v. County of Orange (2005) 103 Cal.App.4th 579, 581 fn.1 [taking judicial notice of trial court			
9	order pursuant to Evid. Code § 452(d)].) Further, this order is relevant to the instant motion			
10	because it involves a similar dispute—whether a city's requirement that voters approve			
11	significant increases in housing (as requirement by initiative) was preempted by state housing			
12 13	laws. Accordingly, the Court should take judicial notice of Exhibit 75.			
13	III. <u>CONCLUSION</u>			
15	For the foregoing reasons, the Court should take judicial notice of Exhibits 1 through 75			
16	attached to Movant's Index of Exhibits.			
17				
18	D. 1 D. 1 A 2024 REVED WANDIEGT & DETERGILD			
19	Dated: December 4, 2024 KEKER, VAN NEST & PETERS LLP			
20	By: /s/ Bailey W. Heaps			
21	BAILEY W. HEAPS JASON GEORGE			
22	JACQUELINE CONCILLA			
23	Attorneys for Petitioner NEWPORT			
24	BEACH STEWARDSHIP ASSOCIATION			
25				
2627				
28				
۷٥				